

To: Dubey, Susmita[dubey.susmita@epa.gov]
Cc: Odendahl, Steve[Odendahl.Steve@epa.gov]; Berry, Laura[berry.laura@epa.gov]; Wehling, Jefferson[Wehling.Jefferson@epa.gov]
From: Denawa, Mai
Sent: Mon 11/14/2016 7:56:24 PM
Subject: RE: Request for Review: DRAFT Email to CDOT/FHWA Advising of Potential Error with the I-70 East Project's PM10 Hot-spot Modeling (Background Concentration)

Susmita,

Thank you for the update.

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

Mai

-----Original Message-----

From: Dubey, Susmita
Sent: Monday, November 14, 2016 12:53 PM
To: Denawa, Mai <Denawa.Mai@epa.gov>
Cc: Odendahl, Steve <Odendahl.Steve@epa.gov>; Berry, Laura <berry.laura@epa.gov>; Wehling, Jefferson <Wehling.Jefferson@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Request for Review: DRAFT Email to CDOT/FHWA Advising of Potential Error with the I-70 East Project's PM10 Hot-spot Modeling (Background Concentration)

Hi, Mai. Thanks for checking in. I talked with Meghan earlier today and she is going to send around a revised schedule for getting the brief done. I think she plans to have a draft for us on Wed.

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy so was unable to work on this for a bit.

Susmita Dubey
Office of General Counsel
202-564-5577

-----Original Message-----

From: Denawa, Mai
Sent: Monday, November 14, 2016 2:50 PM
To: Dubey, Susmita <dubey.susmita@epa.gov>
Cc: Odendahl, Steve <Odendahl.Steve@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Request for Review: DRAFT Email to CDOT/FHWA Advising of Potential Error with the I-70 East Project's PM10 Hot-spot Modeling (Background Concentration)

Hi Susmita,

Hope you had a great long weekend! I was hoping to check-in to see if DOJ has sent around a draft brief already that R8 can start reviewing?

Thanks!

Mai

From: Dubey, Susmita
Sent: Wednesday, November 02, 2016 2:02 PM

To: Denawa, Mai <Denawa.Mai@epa.gov>
Cc: Odendahl, Steve <Odendahl.Steve@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Request for Review: DRAFT Email to CDOT/FHWA Advising of Potential Error with the I-70 East Project's PM10 Hot-spot Modeling (Background Concentration)

Ex. 5 - Attorney Client

Looking forward to working with you on this!

Susmita Dubey

Office of General Counsel

202-564-5577

From: Berry, Laura
Sent: Monday, June 20, 2016 11:48 AM
To: Russ, Timothy <Russ.Tim@epa.gov <mailto:Russ.Tim@epa.gov> >; Dubey, Susmita <dubey.susmita@epa.gov <mailto:dubey.susmita@epa.gov> >; Patulski, Meg <patulski.meg@epa.gov <mailto:patulski.meg@epa.gov> >
Cc: Jackson, Scott <Jackson.Scott@epa.gov <mailto:Jackson.Scott@epa.gov> >
Subject: RE: Request for Review: DRAFT Email to CDOT/FHWA Advising of Potential Error with the I-70 East Project's PM10 Hot-spot Modeling (Background Concentration)

Hi Tim,

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Let me know if you have any questions.

Laura Berry

(734) 214-4858

berry.laura@epa.gov <mailto:berry.laura@epa.gov>

From: Russ, Timothy

Sent: Thursday, June 16, 2016 2:38 PM

To: Dubey, Susmita <dubey.susmita@epa.gov <mailto:dubey.susmita@epa.gov> >; Berry, Laura <berry.laura@epa.gov <mailto:berry.laura@epa.gov> >; Patulski, Meg <patulski.meg@epa.gov <mailto:patulski.meg@epa.gov> >

Cc: Jackson, Scott <Jackson.Scott@epa.gov <mailto:Jackson.Scott@epa.gov> >

Subject: RE: Request for Review: DRAFT Email to CDOT/FHWA Advising of Potential Error with the I-70 East Project's PM10 Hot-spot Modeling (Background Concentration)

Hi Susmita,

Certainly, that's fine. I'll be telecommuting tomorrow and can see the response, or if there's questions – please call my office number and I'll get back to you.

Laura – got your voicemail and thanks!

Tim

Tim Russ

Environmental Scientist

USEPA Region 8

Air Program

1595 Wynkoop Street (8P-AR)

Denver, CO 80202-1129

Ph. (303) 312-6479

Fax (303) 312-6064

e-mail: russ.tim@epa.gov <mailto:russ.tim@epa.gov>

From: Dubey, Susmita

Sent: Thursday, June 16, 2016 12:23 PM

To: Berry, Laura <berry.laura@epa.gov <mailto:berry.laura@epa.gov> >; Patulski, Meg <patulski.meg@epa.gov <mailto:patulski.meg@epa.gov> >

Cc: Russ, Timothy <Russ.Tim@epa.gov <mailto:Russ.Tim@epa.gov> >
Subject: RE: Request for Review: DRAFT Email to CDOT/FHWA Advising of Potential Error with the I-70 East Project's PM10 Hot-spot Modeling (Background Concentration)

Ex. 5 - Attorney Client

Susmita Dubey

Office of General Counsel

202-564-5577(phone)

202-564-5603 (fax)

From: Berry, Laura
Sent: Thursday, June 16, 2016 2:19 PM
To: Dubey, Susmita <dubey.susmita@epa.gov <mailto:dubey.susmita@epa.gov> >; Patulski, Meg <patulski.meg@epa.gov <mailto:patulski.meg@epa.gov> >
Cc: Russ, Timothy <Russ.Tim@epa.gov <mailto:Russ.Tim@epa.gov> >
Subject: FW: Request for Review: DRAFT Email to CDOT/FHWA Advising of Potential Error with the I-70 East Project's PM10 Hot-spot Modeling (Background Concentration)

Ex. 5 - Attorney Client

Laura Berry

(734) 214-4858

berry.laura@epa.gov <mailto:berry.laura@epa.gov>

From: Payton, Richard
Sent: Monday, June 06, 2016 3:07 PM
To: Russ, Timothy <Russ.Tim@epa.gov <mailto:Russ.Tim@epa.gov> >; Jackson, Scott <Jackson.Scott@epa.gov <mailto:Jackson.Scott@epa.gov> >; Berry, Laura <berry.laura@epa.gov <mailto:berry.laura@epa.gov> >
Subject: RE: Request for Review: DRAFT Email to CDOT/FHWA Advising of Potential Error with the I-70 East Project's PM10 Hot-spot Modeling (Background Concentration)

Looks spot on to me.

Richard

From: Russ, Timothy
Sent: Monday, June 06, 2016 11:28 AM
To: Jackson, Scott <Jackson.Scott@epa.gov <mailto:Jackson.Scott@epa.gov> >; Payton, Richard <Payton.Richard@epa.gov <mailto:Payton.Richard@epa.gov> >; Berry, Laura <berry.laura@epa.gov <mailto:berry.laura@epa.gov> >
Subject: Request for Review: DRAFT Email to CDOT/FHWA Advising of Potential Error with the I-70 East Project's PM10 Hot-spot Modeling (Background Concentration)

Hi Scott, Richard, and Laura

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks for your review/edits!

Tim

Tim Russ
Environmental Scientist
USEPA Region 8
Air Program
1595 Wynkoop Street (8P-AR)
Denver, CO 80202-1129
Ph. (303) 312-6479
Fax (303) 312-6064
e-mail: russ.tim@epa.gov <mailto:russ.tim@epa.gov>

=====

DRAFT-DRAFT 6-6-16

=====

Hi Everyone,

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

EPA's November, 2015 PM Hot-spot modeling guidance ("Transportation Conformity Guidance for Quantitative Hot-spot Analyses in PM2.5 and PM10 Nonattainment and Maintenance Areas") notes the following in section 9.3.4 24-hour PM10 NAAQS:

Calculating Design Values and Determining Conformity

The 24-hour PM10 design value is calculated at each receptor by directly adding the sixth-highest modeled 24-hour concentrations (if using five years of meteorological data) to the appropriate monitor value for the 24-hour background concentration from three years of monitoring data, based on Exhibit 9-6.153 Exhibit 9-6: Monitor Value Used for Design Value Calculation

Number of Background Concentration Values from the Monitor

Monitor Value Used for Design Value Calculation

< 347

Highest Monitor Value

348 -695

Second Highest Value

696 -1042

Third Highest Value

1043 -1096

Fourth Highest Value

PM10 data from the Commerce City monitoring site is provided in the table below:

EPA/OTAQ Table of Data

Year

N

Highest value

2nd highest

3rd highest

4th highest

2013

357

144

97

93

89

2012

308

113

86

76

75

2011

351

82

65

64

61

"N" = the number of days of valid data recovery.

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thanks!

Tim

Tim Russ
Environmental Scientist
USEPA Region 8
Air Program
1595 Wynkoop Street (8P-AR)
Denver, CO 80202-1129
Ph. (303) 312-6479
Fax (303) 312-6064

e-mail: russ.tim@epa.gov <mailto:russ.tim@epa.gov>